What's Wrong with Theistic Evolution? Questions to Ask

Vern S. Poythress, Ph.D., Th.D. Westminster Theological Seminary

A. Definition 1: What Is "Evolution"?

Evolution

- ◆ 1. Change over time:
 - "evolution of the cell phone";
 - "evolution of the sun"
- 2. Biological variation within limits:
 - microevolution; dog breeding
- 3. Gradual change to new body plans
 - macroevolution
- 4. Unguided change (no design)

B. Definition 2: What Is "Theistic Evolution"?

Theistic Evolution

- ◆ (1) all living things developed by "*continuous* and *gradual* biological change."¹
- (2) Such change was (a) unguided or (b) undetectably guided (no evidence of design).
- (3) God was somehow behind it.

¹Stephen Meyer, "Introduction to the Controversy: Defining Theistic Evolution," in *Theistic Evolution* (2017)

"Theistic Evolution," As Distinctive

- In the past, used broadly
- Now, prominently, in one way
- Relabeled "evolutionary creationism"

C. Evaluating Questions: Coherent?

Coherence? (1)

- ◆ (1) gradual change
- (2a) unguided
- (3) God behind it



unguided and guided?

Coherence? (2)

- ◆ (1) gradual change
- (2b) undetectably guided
- (3) God behind it

Why?
God shown in his handiwork.

Coherence? (3)

- (1) gradual change
- (2b) undetectably guided
- ◆ (3) God behind it

Why?
God may work
miracles

Coherence? (4)

- ◆ What are random events?
 - roll of dice; individual atoms
- Humanly unpredictable
- God governing?
- Then we include also very unlikely events
- Evidence of design

possibility of miracles

D. Evaluating Questions: Theologically Sound?

Theologically Sound? (1)

God shows himself in his work

The heavens declare the glory of God, and the sky above proclaims his handiwork.

- Ps. 19:1

Consider the lilies of the field, how they grow: – Matt. 6:28

Theologically Sound? (2)

- God, not us, decides when to work exceptionally
- Adam and Eve specially created

E. Evaluating Questions: Scientifically Supported?

Problems with Darwinism

- Origin of life
- Need for massive new information
- Gaps in fossil record
- Limits in genetic variation and mutation
- Irreducibly complex machines
- Not enough time for random walk to success
- No coherent tree of life from genetics

Problems for Alleged Gradualistic Human Origin

- Account for human exceptionalism
- Unique soul goes with unique body
- Account for sin
- Not enough time to establish genetic uniqueness
- Ambiguities in the bones

F. Presuppositions

What Framework for Science?

Materialist Philosophy



Has to be Gradual, Unguided

How did we get here with thoughts?

Biblical Theism



Guided, Gradual or Sudden

Presuppositional Framework: What Works for Science?

Materialist Philosophy Biblical Theism

How did we get here with thoughts?

Materialist philosophy is thoughts, not matter

Undermines itself

We are made in God's image, in tune with law

Basis for science!